

Murdo Macdonald

EIS Research grant 2018/19

31st May 2019

ABSTRACT

N5 Geography 2017 to 2018: Fairer Scotland?

In 2018, the SQA made changes to the assessment of National 5 Geography, the main alteration being an increase in the single paper exam length from 1 hour 45 minutes to 2 hours 20 minutes. In 2018, there was an 9% overall fall in the number of presentations of pupils for National 5 Geography compared to the previous year. For State sector Secondary schools, the fall was almost four times that, percentage wise, compared to non-State sector Secondary schools. In some local authorities, the fall in National 5 Geography presentations was as high as 39%. The percentage decrease in the number of entries of pupils in SIMD 1-4 was higher than for the entire cohort. 63.3% of the presentations of SIMD 1-4 candidates in 2017 obtained an A to C grade. In 2018, this had decreased to 58.2%.

N5 Geography 2017 to 2018: Fairer Scotland?

We have fantastic young people led by dedicated teachers and lecturers delivering first-class education in our schools and colleges every day. And that is backed by a robust, credible assessment system.

John Swinney MSP, 8th August 2018¹

I began my teaching career in 1988 and have taught Geography in an Inner-City school in Glasgow for the past ten years. Since the introduction of the Curriculum for Excellence, I embedded its underlying themes in all aspects of my pedagogy. I developed Outdoor education, spoke at Education Scotland events, presented at the Scottish Learning Festival and was the Glasgow representative for the Scottish Association of Geography teachers. My experience of introducing the new SQA National 5 assessment structure to pupils in my school has led to this report.

As a teacher of Mathematics and Geography, I have long been interested in statistics and the data rich environment of assessment data forms the foundation of this research. I would like to thank the Learning Directorate of the Scottish Government for allowing me to use data held by them. I have attached this data at the end of this paper.

¹ <https://www.scotsman.com/news/opinion/john-swinney-the-evidence-shows-scottish-education-is-first-class-1-4780819>

I believe that recent changes to assessment at National 5 level bring into question the long-term survival of Geography as a popular mainstream school subject. I also believe that the underlying themes of the Curriculum for Excellence, which I embraced, are now under threat due to unnecessary alterations to assessment in the Senior phase which, in the words of EIS General Secretary, Larry Flanagan, 'go further than they had to'.²

² <https://www.tes.com/news/changes-higher-exams-and-courses-go-further-they-had>

PART ONE

FALLING NATIONAL 5 PRESENTATIONS

The Scottish Qualifications Authority (SQA) is the executive non-departmental public body of the Scottish Government responsible for accrediting educational awards and is partly funded by the Scottish Government. Its role in Curriculum for Excellence is to design and develop qualifications and assessment.

The first exam diet of National 5 examinations was in 2014, though not all schools took part in this first year, instead continuing to use SQA Intermediate qualifications which ran concurrently in that first year.

From 2014 to 2017, in order to obtain a National 5 qualification, pupils had to pass mandatory unit assessments, sit an examination and complete an ‘assignment’, a project written up under controlled conditions.

These mandatory unit assessments which hadn’t existed under Standard Grade examinations, led the Educational Institute for Scotland (EIS) to roll out a partial work to rule over, what was argued, an unnecessary additional workload on teachers and pupils. This led to the Scottish Government announcing in 2016, the removal of these units. The Scottish Government said that this change ‘has the distinct purpose of reducing the amount of assessment experienced by young people taking national qualifications and the teacher workload created as a result of administering the units. The course aims, content and rationale are not changing.

The Scottish Qualifications Authority has the responsibility to ensure that the credibility and standards of the qualifications are maintained. Therefore, the removal of units and unit assessments means that the course assessments for National 5, Higher and Advanced Higher need to be strengthened to maintain 24 SCQF credit points and protect the integrity, breadth and standards of the national qualifications.

For each National 5 course, the changes have resulted in one or more of the following:

- extension of the existing question paper
- extension/modification of the existing item of coursework
- a new question paper
- a new item of coursework. ³

In addition, the D grade was extended from a notional 45-49% to 40-49%. The move was intended to recognise the achievement of candidates who are aspiring to attain a National 5 Course, but who do not perform as well as expected in the course assessment. It provides opportunities for candidates who do not achieve grades A to C to have their achievement certificated for the level of qualification for which they were entered. This will give teachers greater certainty that learners can attain an award at the appropriate level.⁴

3

http://www.parliament.scot/S5_Education/General%20Documents/20170330INCabSecEducReChangesNationalQualifications.pdf

⁴ https://www.sqa.org.uk/sqa/files_ccc/QA_Changes_to_National_Courses.pdf

These changes led to an increase in duration of the single paper National 5 Geography examination from 2018 onwards to 2 hours 20 minutes (an increase of 50 minutes from the first exam in 2014), an increase in the number of marks for the exam from 60 to 80 and a slight change in weighting as seen in the table below.

Table 1: National 5 Geography length of exam and assignment and % of final grade⁵

Year	Exam length	Marks	%	Assignment length	%
2014	1 hour 30	60	75	1 hour	25
2015	1 hour 45	60	75	1 hour	25
2016	1 hour 45	60	75	1 hour	25
2017	1 hour 45	60	75	1 hour	25
2018	2 hours 20	80	80	1 hour	20

This paper will look primarily at the variation in the number of National 5 Geography presentations from 2017 to 2018. As discussed previously, the main alteration in 2018 was that the exam for National 5 Geography was to be a single paper of 2 hours and 20 minutes.

I could tell from pupil performance in the prelim examination that our school held in January 2018 that many pupils struggled with an exam of this duration and I heard from other colleagues across the country that their pupils were in the same situation. In my opinion, pupils who would have coped successfully in 2014 when the exam was 1 hr 30 mins, would not have been able to sustain the effort required for 2 hours 20 minutes.

The following data is taken from SQA N5 Geography course reports from 2015-2018.

Table 2 : 2015 to 2018 National 5 Geography total entries⁶

Year	Presentations	Change	% reduction on previous year
2015	11573		
2016	11018	-555	-4.8%
2017	10757	-261	-2.4%
2018	9795	-962	-8.9%

Overall there was a 4% reduction from 2017 to 2018 in the total number of National 5 presentations for all the qualifications offered by the SQA.⁷ For National 5 Geography, the percentage decrease was more than double that figure.

⁶ https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/N5CourseReportGeography2018.pdf

https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/GeographyN5CourseReport2017.pdf

https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/N5GeographyCourseReport2016.pdf

https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/GeographyNational5CR2015.pdf

⁷ <https://www.sqa.org.uk/sqa/64717.html>

The debate around the number of subjects taken by pupils has been well rehearsed in the media and in Parliament. Many Secondary schools have been offering fewer subjects, particularly in S4, for many years now, so this overall fall for 8.9% in one year is troubling.

In my experience of being the Glasgow representative for the Scottish Association of Geography teachers I have had the opportunity to meet with many teachers who work in the Independent sector and I have been surprised by the dissimilarities in experiences I was hearing when the changes to assessment were being discussed.

In order to obtain statistics solely for the State Secondary school sector, I contacted the Learning Directorate of the Scottish Government who furnished me with Publicly funded (including grant-aided) only Secondary school data. The source of this data was 'management information drawn from the Insight Senior Phase Benchmarking tool'. This enabled me to calculate and break down the overall SQA statistics into State Secondary and non-State Secondary data.

Table 3 : 2015 to 2019 State Sector National 5 Geography entries⁸

Year	Presentations	Change	% reduction on previous year
2015	10545		
2016	9888	-657	-6.2%
2017	9633	-255	-2.6%
2018	8689	-944	-9.8%

The corresponding figures for the Non-state sector show a reduction, though of a much lower magnitude.

⁸ https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/N5CourseReportGeography2018.pdf

https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/GeographyN5CourseReport2017.pdf

https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/N5GeographyCourseReport2016.pdf

https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/GeographyNational5CR2015.pdf

Table 4: Non-State sector National 5 Geography entries⁹

Year	Number of resulted entries	Reduction	% reduction
2017	1124		
2018	1096	-28	-2.5%

In the 2015 National 5 Geography course report, when the total number of entries for was 11,573, the report stated that ‘*Candidate responses this year were generally good, with many candidates showing sound geographical knowledge and referring to details from case studies about which they had learned.... more candidates appeared to have been presented at the correct level.*’

Despite an overall 15.4% reduction in the number of resulted entries from 2015 to 2018, the 2018 National 5 Geography Course report states, ‘*The overall quality of candidate responses in 2018 was good, although there were also significant numbers of candidates who struggled with many of the questions and who may have been presented at the wrong level.*’¹⁰

⁹ Data calculated using Learning Directorate (end of report) and SQA course report data

¹⁰ https://www.sqa.org.uk/files_ccc/N5CourseReportGeography2018.pdf

This last point concerns me greatly especially when one considers the overall 8.9% decrease in presentations solely from 2017 to 2018. For the SQA to state that there were significant numbers of candidates who struggled with many of the questions and who have been presented at the wrong level despite that decrease in the number of presentations is, I suggest, indicative of a serious problem.

From my own experience, I knew that this longer sampling of the course was leading to more pupils performing very poorly in prelim examinations leading up to the examination in 2018. It came as no surprise that the Learning Directorate data showed that, for my own local authority, Glasgow City Council, there was a 24% decline in the number of National 5 Geography presentations from 661 in 2017 to 502 in 2018.

In a reply to a question from the Scottish Association of Geography teachers, the SQA said that a survey of pupils which they carried out stated showed that pupils didn't have issues with the longer examination. I have no further information about this survey, about the backgrounds of the pupils, how many pupils asked, nor the questions.

The decline in National 5 Geography presentations from 2017 to 2018 across selected local authorities can be seen in the following table.

Table 5: National 5 Geography presentations: Selected Scottish Local Authorities¹¹

Name	2017	2018	%
Angus	331	248	-25%
Argyll and Bute	186	145	-22%
Clackmannanshire	71	55	-23%
Dundee City	160	113	-29%
East Dunbartonshire	436	380	-13%
Edinburgh, City of	636	515	-19%
Fife	529	467	-12%
Highland	536	472	-12%
Midlothian	142	104	-27%
North Ayrshire	379	316	-17%
Stirling	263	201	-24%
West Dunbartonshire	161	99	-39%

¹¹ From Learning directorate data (at end of report)

61% of ninety members of the Scottish Association of Geography teachers who responded to a poll in May 2019 stated that even fewer candidates were being presented in their schools in 2019 than in 2018. 17% said that the numbers were similar to 2018 and 22% said that more pupils were being presented.

PART TWO

PRESENTATIONS AND POVERTY

Be rigorous about the gaps to be closed and pursue relentlessly 'closing the gap' and 'raising the bar' simultaneously

Improving Schools in Scotland: An OECD Perspective, 2015¹²

The Learning Directorate also gave me the management information data drawn from the Insight Senior phase benchmarking tool summarised by Scottish Index of Multiple Deprivation (SIMD) at the national level. (Insight used SIMD 2016 data for 2017 and 2018).

SIMD provides a relative measure of deprivation based on indicators from 7 domains – income, employment, health, education, access, housing and crime. Deciles are used to represent 10% of a population with a particular level of deprivation. Thus, the most deprived decile (1) equates to the most deprived 10% within a population, while the least deprived decile (10) represents the 10% of a population living in the least deprived circumstances.

As can be clearly seen from the data, the pupils who are the most deprived have the fewest number of presentations for National 5 Geography. There is a positive correlation between SIMD decile and the number of presentations, the higher the SIMD decile the higher the number of presentations.

¹² <https://www.oecd.org/education/school/Improving-Schools-in-Scotland-An-OECD-Perspective.pdf>

Table 6: National 5 Geography State sector presentations 2017 to 2018 by SIMD decile¹³

SIMD	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
2016/17	570	739	745	823	900	1020	1159	1182	1234	1261
2017/18	562	625	647	723	878	905	1014	995	1170	1170
Change	-8	-114	-98	-100	-22	-115	-145	-187	-64	-91
% chg	-0.1	-15.4	-13.1	-12.2	-2.4	-11.2	-12.5	-15.8	-5.2	-7.2

There has been a larger decrease (11.1%) in the number of presentations at N5 Geography for SIMD 1-4 State sector Secondary pupils compared to the reduction of 8.9% of the entire cohort of Secondary school pupils who sat N5 Geography in 2018.

¹³ From Learning directorate data (at end of report)

PART THREE

PLAYING THE PRESENTATION GAME

I believe, from my experience in the classroom, that there is a now a concerning disconnect between the Senior phase, that is S4-6, and the Curriculum for Excellence in general. Throughout Primary education and during the Broad General Education, I do not believe that pupils are being prepared for a 2-hour 20-minute examination, longer than many Honours examinations at University. When we add in the one hour for the assignment at National 5 Geography, this makes a total assessment time of 3 hours 20 minutes, 50 minutes longer than the first O Grade Geography assessment in 1962.

The same assessment structure covers the three Social subjects, Geography, History and Modern Studies. Indeed, it is not solely National 5 Geography which is undergoing a reduction in the number of presentations, though the reduction for National 5 Geography is much larger. All Social subjects have seen reductions in the number of candidates. I also include the percentage of pupils who gained A-C grades in these subjects overall nationally.

Table 7: 2017 to 2018 State Sector National 5 entries¹⁴

Subject	2017	2018	% reduction	Grades A-C
History	15073	14475	-4.0%	78%
Modern Studies	12383	11867	-4.2%	70%
Geography	10757	9795	-8.9%	71%

There are some subjects bucking this downward trend and I believe that further study is required into potential links between the increase in entries for certain subjects and the higher pass rates for many of these subjects. Anecdotal evidence would suggest that pupils and schools are making option choices based on choosing subjects which, in the words of a Headteacher, ‘get good passes’.

¹⁴ <https://www.sqa.org.uk/sqa/64717.html>

Table 8: Selected National 5 overall entries from 2017 to 2018¹⁵

Subject	2017	2018	% increase	Grades A-C
Accounting	846	895	6	80
Physical Education	15211	15396	1	94
Latin	363	390	7	99
Italian	241	286	19	87
ESOL	867	1035	19	80
Dance	499	558	12	92

¹⁵ <https://www.sqa.org.uk/sqa/64717.html>

PART FOUR
LEVEL PLAYING FIELD

So apathetic have the middle-class in Scotland become so far as social progress is concerned—and that, of course, can be accounted for by the fact that they are the dominant class and have all their interests well attended to—that even the vaunted superiority of Scotland in educational affairs is probably a thing of the past.

John MacLean 1908¹⁶

As mentioned previously, SQA Course reports provide teachers and schools around Scotland with statistical information on the performance of candidates, showing the distribution of course awards. These reports are for the entire cohort of candidates entered for each qualification. They are not broken down into the various educational sectors.

Data received from the Learning directorate allowed me, as it did when I looked earlier at differences in presentations, to split the course report data into State sector Secondary schools and non-State sector. The difference in attainment is stark.

¹⁶ <https://www.marxists.org/archive/maclean/works/1908-education.htm>

Table 9: National 5 Geography 2018 results¹⁷

	Overall	%	State	%	Non-State	%
A	2883	29.4	2258	26.0	625	56.5
B	2001	20.5	1774	20.4	227	20.5
C	2050	20.9	1886	21.7	164	14.8
D	1516	15.5	1448	16.7	68	6.1
No award	1345	13.7	1323	15.2	22	2.0

¹⁷ From Learning Directorate data (at end of report) and

<https://www.sqa.org.uk/sqa/64717.html>

Table 10: National 5 Geography 2017 results (post marking review for State figures)¹⁸

	Overall	%	State	%	Non-State	%
A	3753	34.9	3090	32.1	663	59.0
B	2152	20.0	1950	20.2	202	18.0
C	2123	19.7	2026	21.0	63	5.6
D	931	8.5	876	9.1	55	4.9
No award	1798	16.7	1691	17.6	107	9.5

An A, B or C is viewed by the SQA as being the recommended entry requirement for Higher Geography. In 2017, 73.3% of State sector pupils presented for National 5 Geography achieved this. In 2018 this had decreased to 68.1%.

In 2018, 91.8% of non-State Secondary pupils presented for N5 Geography gained an A to C grade. The exact data for 2017 is difficult to ascertain as I only have SQA totals for 2017 pre-marking review and Learning Directorate data for 2017 post-marking review. Under the new marking review system, there is not a great change to the data after marking review is completed. The data above for 2017 would suggest that the percentage gaining A to C was

¹⁸ From Learning Directorate data (at end of report) and

82.6% in 2017. Therefore, I would suggest that there was a rise in the A to C grades for the non-State Secondary sector from 2017 to 2018.

The following tables show attainment by SIMD for the State Secondary sector.

Table 11: National 5 Geography 2018 State Secondary (including grant aided) results by SIMD decile¹⁹

SIMD	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
A to C	59.8%	55.8%	59.5%	59.5%	63.7%	67.6%	70.6%	72.1%	75.9%	79.1%

Table 12: National 5 Geography 2017 post marking review State Secondary (including grant aided) results by SIMD decile²⁰

SIMD	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
A to C	56.8%	61.5%	65.6%	67.3%	70.9%	71.1%	74.1%	76.7%	81.5%	85.6%

¹⁹ From Learning Directorate data (at end of report)

²⁰ From Learning Directorate data (at end of report)

The sole SIMD decile to show an improvement in the percentage of presentations gaining an A to C grade was SIMD 1, albeit based on the lowest number of presentations (562) of any of the deciles.

For SIMD 1 to 4, 1822 out of 2877 (63.3%) presentations in 2017 obtained an A to C grade. In 2018, 1500 out of 2577 (58.2%) presentations obtained an A to C.

CONCLUSION

The decline in presentations for SIMD 1-4 pupils for National 5 Geography in 2018 compared to 2017 was larger than the decrease in the overall cohort and those who were presented gained poor results than in 2017.

Mr. Swinney, in my opinion, this is surely unacceptable for a country with a 'robust, credible assessment system'.

Contents

[National 5 Geography Attainment summarised by SIMD decile at the National Level](#)

[National 5 Geography Attainment summarised by SIMD quintile at Local Authority level](#)

Data Source

These data are management information drawn from the Insight Senior Phase Benchmarking Tool

Pupil cohort

These data are provided for senior phase (S4-S6) pupils from publicly funded (including grant-aided) secondary schools for the years 2014 to 2018.

Attainment

The base cohort for attainment is provided as the total number of resulted entries for National Geography (Qualification Code C733/C833) i.e. individual grades and 'no awards'

In the National table, attainment has been broken down by grades A to D.

In the Local Authority Summary grades that constitute an award (A to D) are combined

Changes in SIMD

Insight used SIMD 2016 data for the latest years of data (2017 and 2018). No historic data was re-calculated so all years prior to 2017 are based on SIMD 2012.

The SIMD enables schools to map their performance against the social context in which they operate. The SIMD identifies small area concentrations of multiple deprivation across Scotland. It is based on data zones (a small area geographically) and provides an assessment of multiple deprivation based on income, employment, health, education, housing, access to services and levels of crime in the area. It provides a relative measure of deprivation which means that the data zones can be ranked from most to least deprived and cut offs can be applied to identify different levels of deprivation.

The calculation of deciles means that the data zones have been ranked and split into ten equal parts with decile 1 being the most deprived 10% of data zones and decile 10 being the least deprived 10% of data zones. The calculation of quintiles means that the data zones have been ranked and split into five equal parts with quintile 1 being the most deprived 20% and quintile 5 being the least deprived 20%. Based on the postcode of the school leaver from the Pupil Census, it is possible to identify which data zone the school leaver lives in and therefore which deprivation decile. This allows us to look at attainment across the school by level of deprivation.

Note that in a very small number of cases, pupil postcodes were missing or invalid and in these cases the postcode of the school has been used instead.

* indicates suppression of cohorts between 1 and 4 and for cohorts which would allow small numbers of pupils to be inferred

National Summary for National Geography

The number of students achieving A-D by SIMD Decile

Year	Grade	SIMD D1	SIMD D2	SIMD D3	SIMD D4	SIMD D5	SIMD D6	SIMD D7	SIMD D8	SIMD D9	SIMD D10	Total number of students
2014	A	86	101	111	174	234	309	444	404	494	544	2901
2014	B	92	128	143	176	219	254	297	262	320	249	2140
2014	C	109	137	132	185	211	237	258	259	231	200	1959
2014	D	62	55	66	63	87	70	88	90	92	48	721
2014	Resulted Entries	479	550	582	758	909	1007	1266	1163	1269	1135	9118
2015	A	98	150	176	252	320	384	495	493	665	632	3665
2015	B	144	155	165	216	219	275	360	288	338	290	2450
2015	C	147	193	194	208	263	239	293	286	235	187	2245
2015	D	94	81	88	98	91	123	121	97	99	82	974
2015	Resulted Entries	596	699	753	906	1037	1142	1417	1295	1444	1256	10545
2016	A	108	157	157	248	290	332	429	486	500	584	3291
2016	B	140	158	185	218	255	272	336	286	302	268	2420
2016	C	171	168	179	202	220	253	246	251	244	189	2123
2016	D	79	86	74	101	83	105	95	90	79	47	839
2016	Resulted Entries	641	699	700	892	984	1096	1248	1229	1234	1165	9888
2017	A	94	125	163	206	253	298	394	453	511	593	3090
2017	B	93	158	136	157	192	225	246	230	240	273	1950
2017	C	137	172	190	191	193	202	249	223	255	214	2026
2017	D	81	82	82	84	79	112	105	96	84	71	876
2017	Resulted Entries	570	739	745	823	900	1020	1159	1182	1234	1261	1691
2018	A	95	89	103	134	189	232	264	280	406	466	2258
2018	B	89	124	120	130	173	186	231	224	254	243	1774
2018	C	152	136	162	166	197	194	221	213	228	217	1886
2018	D	105	132	124	144	174	168	147	154	154	146	1448
2018	Resulted Entries	562	625	647	723	878	905	1014	995	1170	1170	8689

Local Authority Summary

Number of resulted entries achieving A-D by SIMD Quintile

Local Authority	Year	SIMD Q1	SIMD Q2	SIMD Q3	SIMD Q4	SIMD Q5	Total resulted entries
Aberdeen City	2014	18	18	23	21	120	225
Aberdeen City	2015	31	23	26	28	88	214
Aberdeen City	2016	19	20	27	36	113	250
Aberdeen City	2017	10	25	25	39	90	210
Aberdeen City	2018 *		22	23	43	110	222
Aberdeenshire	2014 *		8	81	194	181	570
Aberdeenshire	2015	7	20	104	171	155	553
Aberdeenshire	2016	6	14	102	156	134	491
Aberdeenshire	2017 *		8	67	133	128	426
Aberdeenshire	2018	7	21	70	121	161	509
Angus	2014	18	21	65	136	48	327
Angus	2015	15	37	58	127	62	330
Angus	2016	10	23	52	116	47	287
Angus	2017	13	32	76	77	68	331
Angus	2018	10	15	57	63	60	248
Argyll & Bute	2014	6	21	85	50 *		181
Argyll & Bute	2015	6	27	73	58 *		192
Argyll & Bute	2016	8	25	61	45 *		162
Argyll & Bute	2017	6	18	61	47	15	186
Argyll & Bute	2018	8	10	60	37	12	145
Clackmannanshire	2014	12	5	9	10	0	55
Clackmannanshire	2015	13	9	18	15	6	67
Clackmannanshire	2016	12	9	17	12 *		59
Clackmannanshire	2017	7	21	5	10	5	71
Clackmannanshire	2018	8	10	10 *		8	55
Dumfries & Galloway	2014	18	36	110	55	13	257

Dumfries & Galloway	2015	10	47	117	93	22	309
Dumfries & Galloway	2016	21	43	105	67	21	277
Dumfries & Galloway	2017	7	55	91	51	35	294
Dumfries & Galloway	2018	19	59	96	49	35	291
Dundee City	2014	24	9	17	33	38	141
Dundee City	2015	47	10	15	26	24	159
Dundee City	2016	27	17	10	14	37	130
Dundee City	2017	31	21	9	26	32	160
Dundee City	2018	21	8	8	19	31	113
East Ayrshire	2014	25	30	12	23	12	136
East Ayrshire	2015	26	33	21	16	29	167
East Ayrshire	2016	44	31	26	17	29	167
East Ayrshire	2017	36	30	29	39	16	186
East Ayrshire	2018	28	28	28	29	33	171
East Dunbartonshire	2014	13	36	35	59	239	426
East Dunbartonshire	2015	26	46	50	50	245	447
East Dunbartonshire	2016	29	65	47	70	252	505
East Dunbartonshire	2017	27	48	28	71	202	436
East Dunbartonshire	2018	27	57	22	56	189	380
East Lothian	2014	7	13	26	84	47	214
East Lothian	2015	*	21	45	106	52	243
East Lothian	2016	*	23	24	77	39	180
East Lothian	2017	*	22	30	67	49	189
East Lothian	2018	5	30	41	59	46	228
East Renfrewshire	2015	22	42	37	108	275	499
East Renfrewshire	2016	36	28	37	89	226	431
East Renfrewshire	2017	23	26	26	52	226	383
East Renfrewshire	2018	20	25	39	54	235	393
Edinburgh, City of	2014	44	40	56	95	333	657
Edinburgh, City of	2015	33	49	47	103	312	607

Edinburgh, City of	2016	54	68	69	94	282	651
Edinburgh, City of	2017	52	48	49	65	324	636
Edinburgh, City of	2018	39	38	48	66	233	515
Falkirk	2014	19	29	19	24	30	138
Falkirk	2015	14	40	35	43	72	229
Falkirk	2016	17	41	32	49	75	243
Falkirk	2017	24	42	28	48	57	231
Falkirk	2018	19	38	36	43	41	221
Fife	2014	53	64	105	100	151	582
Fife	2015	60	69	101	119	136	579
Fife	2016	60	92	75	102	104	544
Fife	2017	44	72	71	105	118	529
Fife	2018	34	57	65	79	125	467
Glasgow City	2014	172	79	44	42	34	487
Glasgow City	2015	235	84	52	51	58	579
Glasgow City	2016	222	100	73	57	37	564
Glasgow City	2017	222	79	84	71	59	661
Glasgow City	2018	210	68	73	37	44	502
Highland	2014	17	66	172	234	72	631
Highland	2015	12	64	149	191	49	533
Highland	2016	21	84	145	193	50	578
Highland	2017	22	48	146	158	60	536
Highland	2018	29	69	125	135	51	472
Inverclyde	2014	21	11	17	18	15	88
Inverclyde	2015	34	12	14	17	20	113
Inverclyde	2016	30	10	12	12	15	94
Inverclyde	2017	16	6 *		11 *		55
Inverclyde	2018	18	9	9	15	9	81
Midlothian	2014 *		31	41	48	55	204
Midlothian	2015	9	47	46	46	36	212

Midlothian	2016	5	24	19	41	22	138
Midlothian	2017	*	26	21	17	28	142
Midlothian	2018	10	28	18	17	16	104
Moray	2014	*	8	37	49	18	141
Moray	2015	*	12	62	73	26	208
Moray	2016	0	15	52	74	20	186
Moray	2017	*	9	35	65	23	168
Moray	2018	*	8	30	46	25	138
Na h-Eileanan Siar	2014	0	26	38	*	0	79
Na h-Eileanan Siar	2015	0	27	47	*	0	82
Na h-Eileanan Siar	2016	0	19	53	0	0	78
Na h-Eileanan Siar	2017	0	8	52	*	0	72
Na h-Eileanan Siar	2018	0	6	33	*	0	46
North Ayrshire	2014	40	26	45	79	62	329
North Ayrshire	2015	82	57	64	106	65	424
North Ayrshire	2016	85	48	41	86	55	383
North Ayrshire	2017	81	59	50	61	53	379
North Ayrshire	2018	65	56	38	44	46	316
North Lanarkshire	2014	105	174	140	113	92	763
North Lanarkshire	2015	140	202	164	123	98	814
North Lanarkshire	2016	154	197	148	126	66	762
North Lanarkshire	2017	130	143	112	124	84	706
North Lanarkshire	2018	128	109	144	120	71	628
Orkney Islands	2014	0	12	7	31	*	78
Orkney Islands	2015	0	12	5	73	0	105
Orkney Islands	2016	0	16	10	43	*	82
Orkney Islands	2017	0	16	16	34	*	73
Orkney Islands	2018	0	*	9	31	*	57
Perth & Kinross	2014	*	11	36	115	74	268
Perth & Kinross	2015	10	15	41	153	110	347

Perth & Kinross	2016	5	19	57	119	67	291
Perth & Kinross	2017	5	13	46	104	53	260
Perth & Kinross	2018	8	9	60	111	62	284
Renfrewshire	2014	34	20	49	54	94	289
Renfrewshire	2015	50	49	90	47	105	374
Renfrewshire	2016	60	52	111	67	119	456
Renfrewshire	2017	30	44	65	53	106	357
Renfrewshire	2018	50	41	55	54	79	340
Scottish Borders	2014	8	17	64	128	18	254
Scottish Borders	2015	6	27	83	123	26	285
Scottish Borders	2016	*	25	61	127	11	243
Scottish Borders	2017	*	16	74	84	34	261
Scottish Borders	2018	8	16	74	66	36	242
Shetland Islands	2014	0	*	19	26	12	78
Shetland Islands	2015	0	0	17	49	5	85
Shetland Islands	2016	0	0	17	43	12	85
Shetland Islands	2017	0	*	*	43	0	60
Shetland Islands	2018	0	*	6	43	0	58
South Ayrshire	2014	12	42	52	32	68	241
South Ayrshire	2015	19	58	47	33	63	266
South Ayrshire	2016	15	37	41	32	39	192
South Ayrshire	2017	22	37	29	29	47	205
South Ayrshire	2018	30	35	32	22	37	184
South Lanarkshire	2014	54	93	142	127	151	637
South Lanarkshire	2015	81	129	191	174	179	818
South Lanarkshire	2016	57	118	172	147	153	718
South Lanarkshire	2017	46	138	130	174	113	695
South Lanarkshire	2018	67	122	117	159	105	638
Stirling	2014	6	24	29	84	91	273
Stirling	2015	11	24	22	58	74	204

Stirling	2016	6	23	31	54	85	231
Stirling	2017	9	14	29	71	93	263
Stirling	2018 *		9	29	49	85	201
West Dunbartonshire	2014	18	22	17	10	7	108
West Dunbartonshire	2015	41	37	24	12	14	155
West Dunbartonshire	2016	27	33	27	13	5	126
West Dunbartonshire	2017	39	32	24	19	19	161
West Dunbartonshire	2018	23	30	11	13	5	99
West Lothian	2014	13	55	26	17	50	196
West Lothian	2015	17	67	47	31	69	281
West Lothian	2016	30	44	52	32	59	257
West Lothian	2017	22	50	34	38	64	259
West Lothian	2018	23	42	42	34	74	275